Diversity Foundations: Bias Awareness and Mitigation

Tibisay Hernandez
Manager of DEI Solutions
January 2022
Meet Your Facilitator

Tibisay has over 15 years of experience in the educational environment as well as deep expertise in diversity, equity, and inclusion initiatives. Tibisay is a certified implicit bias facilitator for the National Training Institute for Racial Equity and trains extensively on cultural responsiveness and inequity. Prior to joining Grand River Solutions, Tibisay spent six years working with the University at Albany developing DEI curriculum and measures to address implicit bias at the personal, organizational, and cultural level. She is currently a doctoral candidate in the University at Albany's Education, Theory, and Practice program. Her research interests include the impact of cultural differences and intercultural communication styles on support structures for first-generation college students.

Tibisay Hernandez
Manager of DEI Solutions
**Vision**
We exist to help create safe and equitable work and educational environments.

**Mission**
Bring systemic change to how school districts and institutions of higher education address their Clery Act & Title IX obligations.

**Core Values**
- Responsive Partnership
- Innovation
- Accountability
- Transformation
- Integrity
RULES OF ENGAGEMENT
Creating Curious Spaces

Requires Participant Consent to:
• Be fully present
• Listen with an open mind
• Use “I” or “In my experience” statements
• Seek to understand and not just be heard
• Explore impact; acknowledge intent
• Expect discomfort
Do you go to the gym?
Agenda

01. PERSONAL IDENTITY
What is personal identity? How does it affect how we are seen and see others?

02. THE NEUROSCIENCE OF BIAS
How do our brains process information? In what ways does this affect how we see the world?

03. IMPLICIT BIAS
What is implicit bias? How does implicit bias show up in the world?
The Neuroscience of Bias

How do our brains process information?

In what ways does this affect how we see the world?
What is better?
Mariah or Whitney
Day or Night
iPhone or Android
Chris Rock or Eddie Murphy
Raise or Promotion
Health or Wealth
Perceptions and Bias

Your views are informed by your lived experiences.

- Media
- Family
- Friends
- Education
- Societal Cues
- Culture

Your identity informs how you see the world and how the world sees you.

Multiple truths exist!

• Y O U R V A N T A G E P O I N T, Y O U R B I A S
Is the Great Wall of China visible from the moon?

True

False
"The only thing you can see from the moon is a beautiful sphere, mostly white, some blue and patches of yellow, and every once in a while some green vegetation," Apollo 12 astronaut Alan Bean told NASA. "No man-made object is visible at this scale."
What percentage of our brains do we actively use?

10%

20%

30%

almost 100%
"It turns out that we use virtually every part of the brain, and that [most of] the brain is active almost all the time."

- Barry Gordon, Neurologist at Johns Hopkins School of Medicine.
Bats are blind.
Bats rely on "echolocation" in low-light environments when trying to find prey and other food sources.

Large bats” can see three times better than humans."

Rob Mies, Executive director of the Organization for Bat Conservation
Why do we believe debunked facts?
Two Things Help Change Beliefs

Failure

Trusted Person with New Information
So, how else does our brain work?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blue</th>
<th>Red</th>
<th>Green</th>
<th>Black</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Red</td>
<td>Blue</td>
<td>Black</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Blue</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Red</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>Blue</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Stroop, J. R. (1935)
Becoming aware of what we do not see the first time can help us see it all the time!
What We Now Know

Recap

Our brains are impacted by our lived experiences.

These experiences affect what information we focus on and how we categorize it.

Changing how we process information can be difficult, even when we are directed.
Personal Identity

What is personal identity?
How does identity affect how we are seen and see others?
What is Identity?

• Our identities consist of various characteristics we use to categorize and define ourselves.

• There are visible and invisible characteristics.

• Some identities give advantages.
Discussion

1. Identities you think about most often

2. Identities you think about least often

3. Think of a time when you were othered due to an identity you possess
   • How did you respond?
Implicit Bias

What is implicit bias?
How does implicit bias affect the workplace?
Stereotypes

A generalization where all group members are identified as having the same characteristics; actual differences among the members are ignored or not recognized.

• e.g., all surgeons are men.

Beliefs that associate groups with traits.

Stereotypes are created by an overexposure to single stories.
Which sector has a higher percentage of Hispanic males 15 - 24 from highest to lowest?

A. military, penal system, college
B. penal system, college, military
C. college, penal system, military
Post-Secondary Pathways for HS Graduates, Ages 15 to 24

Sources: Dept of Education; Bureau of Justice Statistics/DOJ
Kernel of Truth

• Descriptions that may accurately describe some members of a stereotyped group but may not apply to every member of the group.
  • e.g., most Italians may love sauce but not all.
Break-Out Room Activity!
Your Turn

• Think of a stereotype about Millennials
• Form a group with 1-2 other people
• Share the Millennials stereotypes in your group
• Indicate how true at least one stereotype is by agreeing on a rough percentage of Millennials to whom it actually applies
• Agree on a rough percentage of Gen X’ers and Gen Z to whom the same Millennials stereotype applies
• You should end up with three percentages, one for each group
Discussion

On what did you base your percentages?

**Social Tactic for Mitigating Bias**

Do not argue personal experience. We all have personal experiences, but we seldom have the actual DATA!!
Prejudice

A positive or negative feeling about a person based on beliefs (stereotypes) about the group to which the person belongs; a prejudgment that involves liking or disliking.

Prejudice tends to be based on social comparison with other groups in which one’s group is the point of reference (norm/ideal).

Social Tactic: Notice difference, but do not assign value (judging something or someone to be inherently better or worse).
Discrimination

• A behavior or action towards someone based on feelings one holds towards the group to which that person belongs.

• The behavioral manifestation of prejudice.

• Overt Examples: denial of job opportunities; redlining.

• Covert Examples: microaggressions.
  • e.g., most Italians may love sauce but not all.
Implicit Bias

Stereotypical thoughts, which can be followed by feelings (liking/disliking) and/or discriminatory behaviors.

Tends to involve a limited or inaccurate perception of others.
Experiences
- Media
- Beliefs
- Education

Implicit Bias
- Automatic Thoughts
- Feelings

Actions
- Discriminatory
- Non-Discriminatory
- Overt
- Covert
Why Bias Exists

Minimal Group Effect
• In-group favoritism occurs even when group membership is random.
• We are built to connect.

Bias and Self-Esteem
• Bias can be self-affirming.
• If other groups are inferior, my group (“I”) must be superior.

Rationalization for Oppression
• Powerful group often retains power using stereotypes and prejudices.

Socialization/Exposure
• We learn it.
• Influence of family, teachers, peers, media, and experience.

Lack of Exposure to the Diversity within Other Groups
• We tend to appreciate the diversity within our own groups, but not other groups.

Categorization
• Our mental tendency to group things, including people (e.g., race, gender, and age in the U.S.).
Bias in Action
Brain Activity Break!
What are some commonly held beliefs about homelessness?
A Single Story...
What is his story?

1. What stereotypes might people have about this individual?
2. What are some barriers this individual may be facing?
3. What can this individual do to stop being homeless?
with layers!
Discussion

1. Did you learn anything new that surprised you about this individual?

2. What did you think about the food issue that was discussed? Had you ever considered that as a barrier?

3. What stereotypes did this individual have about his own community?

4. How did the interviewer push back on his views?
Statistics

Total Number of People Experiencing Homelessness per Year by Type, 2007–2019

- Overall: 567,715
- Individuals: 396,045
- People in Families: 171,670
- Chronically Homeless Individuals: 96,141
- Veterans: 37,085
- Unaccompanied Youth: 35,038

Prioritized Groups

• 17% of the homeless population are chronically homeless individuals who are disabled and have experienced long-term and/or repeated episodes of homelessness.

• 7% are veterans and are prioritized due to their service to our country.

• 6% are unaccompanied youth and are prioritized due to their vulnerable age group consisting of those under 25 years old.

• Subpopulations prioritized in policy and practice (including funding decisions) have made the most impressive gains over the last decade.
  • Veterans experienced the greatest decreases in homelessness—50 percent.

When we prioritize...

• What identity labels were used to prioritize these groups?

• Do you agree with prioritizing these groups?

• Veterans experienced a 50% reduction in homelessness. What does this tell us about prioritizing groups?

• Should homeless youth be treated the same way veterans are?
Equality vs. Equity

Inequality
Unequal access to opportunities

Equality?
Evenly distributed tools and assistance

Equity
Custom tools that identify and address inequality

Justice
Fixing the system to offer equal access to both tools and opportunities
What does Implicit Bias look like in the real world?
Which Hurricane Is More Dangerous?
Researchers sent out 5,000 resumes with white-sounding names and African-American names to potential employers

- White names received 50% more callbacks
- Whites with a criminal record were interviewed at a rate of 17%
- African-Americans without a criminal record were interviewed at a rate of 14%
- African-Americans with a criminal record were interviewed at a rate of 5%
All things being equal yet unequal...

- Taller employees receive higher wages than their shorter counterparts. (Schick & Steckel, 2015)
- Thinner job applicants were less likely to be recommended to be hired for a job when they were seen in a photo sitting next to a larger applicant than when sitting alone or next to a thinner person. (Hebl & Mannix, 2003)
- In a study of performance reviews, 66% of women received negative feedback on their personal style such as “You can sometimes be abrasive”? Compare to 1% of men.
- When a woman’s name was replaced with a man’s name on a résumé, evaluators were 60% more likely to hire the applicant.
Can algorithms have bias?
Implicit Bias in Early Education

- Teachers watched a video of a classroom and were asked to identify challenging behaviors.
- Eye tracking showed the amount of time they spent watching each child.
Expulsions Among Pre-School Students in 2017-18
Students with disabilities served under IDEA represented 13.2% total enrollment.

Received 23.3% of all expulsions with educational services.

Received 14.8% of expulsions without education services.
Microaggressions

Statements, actions, or incidents regarded as instances of indirect, subtle, or unintentional discrimination against members of a marginalized group.
Microaggression Mosquitoes

FOR PEOPLE WHO STILL DON'T THINK
The impact of bias on the target.
Stereotype Threat

The threat of being viewed through the lens of a negative stereotype or the fear of doing something that would inadvertently confirm a stereotype.

The hypervigilance and extra stress uses up cognitive resources.

Can affect performance.
Discourages individuals from building valuable relationships.
Attributional Ambiguity

- A state of uncertainty about the cause of a person's outcomes or treatment.
- Targets of prejudice experience ambiguity about the causes of both good and bad events.
- Augment: "I deserve to be treated this way."
- Discount: "I just got in because of affirmative action."
Internalized Messages
Coping Strategies

Ways in which one deals with (positive/negative) prejudice and the various -isms can include:

- Appeal to authorities
- Educating the ignorant
- Lash out at the behavior
- Avoid the behavior
Brain Activity Break!
Strategies for Mitigating Personal Bias
Personal Mitigation Strategies

- Bias Awareness
- Cultural Immersion
- Visualize and Empathize
- Priming for Equity
- PACE your Response
Bias Awareness

- Look for your biases.
  - Implicit Association Test
  - Self-awareness and reflection about when and why you may be experiencing discomfort
- Bias posters and reminders
- Resist the urge to shame or guilt.
- Remember that because you are human, you have bias!
• Seek opportunities to encounter and engage in positive interactions with out-group members.
  • Attend cultural events.
  • Engage with people outside of your community.
  • Invite out group members to your events.

• Positive contact can alter perceptions of the group or directly improve evaluations of the group. (Pettigrew & Tropp, 2006)

• Use tools like movies, podcasts, and books.
• Visualize in detail positive examples that go against a stereotype.
  • These others can be abstract (a Muslim family eating dinner), famous (Muhammad Ali), or non-famous (a personal friend).
• Put yourself in their shoes.
Pick a character.
What is one good quality you can find in this character?
How might this character be misunderstood?
Priming Activity
What’s the word?

G R E E _
What’s the word?

G R E E
No atrio do hotel.
Priming for Equity

- Occurs when what we see or hear impacts what we think or feel about what we see next.
- We can use priming to interrupt stereotypes and to stay aware of bias.
  - Eg., Check Your Bias poster
Find Your P.A.C.E

- When trying to convince someone of why they should or can do something, it's important to be clear on why they think they can't.

Anticipate/Acknowledge

- Anticipate questions or pain points the person may have.
- Acknowledge when there has been a negative impact.

Connect

- Connect your views to the person's values.
- Connect to similar emotions you may have experienced.

Explore Options

- Can you find a middle ground?
- Are there mutually beneficial options?
Is that it?
Strategies for Mitigating Institutional Bias
Institutional Mitigation Strategies

- Track
- Target
- Train
- Respond Responsibly
- Restore
- Reward
Track

- Analyze existing data to identify systemic implicit bias in organization.
  - Potential implicit bias within an organization: hiring, promotion, discipline, curriculum
  - Potential implicit bias in service delivery and impact between organization and students, families, community members, etc.
- Power Mapping
Target

- Develop concrete, objective indicators and outcomes for hiring, evaluation, and promotion to reduce standard stereotypes. (Fiske & Taylor, 1991; Heilman, 2001; Bernat & Manis, 1994)
- Utilize targeted universalism to set universal goals and use targeted processes to achieve those goals.
Train

• Promote bias literacy through ongoing training.
  • Everyday bias examples help individuals be more self-aware and vigilant.
  • Normalizes bias as a human trait.
• Review your institutional data.
  • Provide updates on where you are and where you want to go.
• Opportunities for discussions with diverse groups can help individuals feel more secure in exploring their bias.
Respond Responsibly

• Have clear standards to guide behavior and practices that are easily available and can be reasonably assessed.
• Consistently hold individuals accountable for behaviors that violate these standards.
• Be willing to share good and bad news (internally or externally as appropriate).
Restore

• Utilize restorative practices when violations occur to repair harm, restore relationships, and reduce the possibility of the violation recurring.

• Facilitate discussions to explore how everyone has been affected by an offense and, when possible, to decide how to repair the harm and meet community needs. (McCold, 2003)
Reward

• Develop standardized criteria to assess the impact of individual contributions to a more inclusive campus in performance evaluations. (Heilman & Haynes, 2005)

• Celebrate your wins and create opportunities for community gratitude.
What else can we do?

1. Use personal mitigation strategies to limit biased behavior.
2. Implement institutional bias mitigation strategies to create bias safeguards in your systems.
3. Collect the data and keep track of how you are doing.
Why Diversity Matters

Enriches the educational and workplace experience by encouraging critical thinking and cross-cultural communication.

Promotes personal growth and challenges stereotyped preconceptions.

Studies consistently show that diversity drives innovation and fosters creativity.
Why Inclusion Matters

Students report that it is important for them to see themselves reflected in the faculty and curriculum to which they are exposed to create a sense of belonging and inclusiveness.

Students report less discrimination and bias at institutions where they perceive a stronger institutional commitment to diversity.

More collegial working environments lead to higher performance and lower turnover among staff and faculty.

Why It’s Worth It!

- Cultivating **TRUST**
- Creating more **EQUITABLE** outcomes
- Creating a sense of **BELONGING**
- Fostering and practice critical **THINKING** skills
- Making **SUSTAINABLE** changes to preserve our institutions
Take-Home Messages

1. All human beings have bias!

2. Implicit bias has multiple causes but overexposure to single stories is a main cause.

3. The impact of our biases on others can be harmful (microaggressions /discrimination).

4. You can have a stereotypical thought, prejudicial feeling, and choose to not discriminate.